

**CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS
AGENDA ITEM
AGENDA SUMMARY FORM**

DEPARTMENT: Mayor & Council

AGENDA DATE: August 23, 2016

CONTACT PERSON NAME AND PHONE NUMBER: Jim Tolbert, 212-0002

DISTRICT(S) AFFECTED: ALL

STRATEGIC GOAL: Goal #2: Set the Standard for a Safe and Secure City.

SUBJECT:

APPROVE a resolution / ordinance / lease to do what? OR **AUTHORIZE** the City Manager to do what? Be descriptive of what we want Council to approve. Include \$ amount if applicable. *Report by City Manager on the Task Force convened to review, assess and overhaul City Boards and Commissions to include members of this task force, and its' duties and objectives.*

BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION:

Discussion of the what, why, where, when, and how to enable Council to have reasonably complete description of the contemplated action. This should include attachment of bid tabulation, or ordinance or resolution if appropriate. What are the benefits to the City of this action? What are the citizen concerns? Several committee members have voiced concerns that the boards and commissions are being revamped and considered for sunsetting or holding meetings quarterly. This has not been shared with Council as a whole, and this report by the City Manager would serve to educate council and the public on what the plans are for the members who serve on these boards and committees.

PRIOR COUNCIL ACTION:

Has the Council previously considered this item or a closely related one? **NO**

AMOUNT AND SOURCE OF FUNDING:

How will this item be funded? Has the item been budgeted? If so, identify funding source by account numbers and description of account. Does it require a budget transfer? **NO**

*******REQUIRED AUTHORIZATION*******

INTRODUCTION

City of El Paso Council appointed Boards, Commissions and Committees (“Committees”) play a vital role in municipal government through citizen volunteers who provide invaluable insights and input into city programs, policies and regulations. Committees play advisory roles for particular issue areas and sometimes play a key role in providing direct services through their actions thus directly impacting their fellow citizens. This report addresses several areas of concerns regarding the City of El Paso Committees and suggests ways in which to remedy these concerns and institute possible efficiencies.

The concerns are organized by the following topic areas.

1. Webpage Organization and Information Presentation
2. Total number of Committees
3. Committees with Direct Service Impact to Citizens/State Mandate (analysis)
4. Appointments, Vacancies and Quorum Issues
5. Training Needs
6. Administrative Needs/Staffing
7. Reconciliation/Reducing Number of Committees
8. Highlight work to date and efforts thus far

It should be noted that a lot of clean-up work revising contact information for all Committees to align these with the current City organizational chart has been done over the last few months as this report has been in development. Correct department and contact points for all information available on-line has been updated and a tremendous amount of clean-up work has been completed by the staff from the Municipal Clerk facilitating this report. However, the concern areas above remain to be addressed and the bulk of the report presents the concerns and recommendations to address.

1. Webpage Organization and Information Presentation

While the Municipal Clerk’s office is the repository of information, overall responsibility for maintaining information about each Committee is assigned to every Department that staffs a Committee. While information on the Municipal Clerk’s page is centralized and updated by various staff in other departments, the final webpage information resides within the Municipal Clerk’s overall page and this information is presented in a matter that makes getting the total number of Committees difficult to discern. There are two distinct on-line webpages where Boards and Committees are listed on the City’s webpage. There is overlap between these two and there is no complete comprehensive list available to determine which are inactive, active, which are active but dormant or which are staffed by external agencies to the City.

The Municipal Clerk’s office lists 52 Committees on its Boards and Committees webpage “Boards & Commissions A – Z” and in the “Appointment Interest Form.” However, the “Meetings” listing includes 19 distinct Boards & Committees. Between these two on-line listings of Committees, twelve committees overlap and are listed in both places. The combined total number of Committees is 60. Of these, eleven (11) are staffed by external agencies and 1 does not include appointees (and thus was dropped from consideration and is not listed in Table 2) leaving 59 total City Council-Appointed Committees. Fourteen (14) appear to be sunsetted and two (2) are dormant. There is an additional committee—the Tax Advisory Committee—staffed internally that may need to be added to the list though agendas for it have not been posted regularly despite the fact that the Council appoints some members. In total, only 34 Committees with members appointed by City Council or the Mayor are staffed by City Departments and two of these are dormant.

Organizing the “Active” versus “Inactive” Committees will improve the on-line presentation. Further, noting which committees are staffed by external entities for the Active List will help organize the information better as will noting which committees are Active but dormant. An explanation as to why a Committee is dormant is also recommended. Another concern was the difficulty to locate the Appointment Interest Form making it not user friendly for citizens interested in joining a Committee and there is a recommendation to address this. Table 1 below lists Committees by status category to help clean up the information. Table 2 has all the existing Committees and the recommendation on how to label each to get accurate counts for all.

Table 1 below lists Committees by status category to help clean up the information. Table 2 has all the existing Committees and the recommendation on how to label each to get accurate counts for all.

Table 1. Committees by Status Category

| Category | Count | Follow Up |
|------------------|-------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Active- External | 11 | List as externally staffed |
| Active | 33 | Periodic review to ensure information is correct (may need to add Tax office committee to list upon review by Legal) |
| Inactive | 14 | May need to be deleted from on-line listings unless there is a reason to keep information available to the public |
| Active - Dormant | 2 | List reason for dormancy |

Possible Recommendations:

1. For consistency and organization, the information on the webpages listing Committees needs to reflect which committees are active, inactive, dormant or sunsetted and which are externally versus internally staffed (See Table 1 & 2). For the overlap between webpages, that can remain, but the master list needs to note which Committees are sunsetted. If there is a reason to continue to have the information on-line, this can remain; if not, archiving this is recommended.
2. The Committees list found on the “Board and Committees A - Z” webpage needs to add an information item that reflects if a certain committee has a specific sunset date.
3. At a minimum, once a year the Municipal Clerk’s Office needs to invite Departments to review the Committees list and ensure the contact information is up to date and to make any other updates as necessary.
4. To be more user friendly, the appointment interest form needs a more prominent placement on the webpage, suggestion is a banner that when clicked it takes you directly to the form to fill out. There are more recommendations related to the appointment interest form in the Appointments/Vacancies section below.
5. There needs to be a review of the Inactive committees to determine if preserving this information on-line in public views required by the Texas Open Meetings Act. If the information can be deleted it is suggested it should be removed. If information needs to be retained, it should be archived off-line so it is not viewable on the webpage. This will produce a cleaner webpage for the viewer.
6. A review of the Committee staffed by the Tax Office should be considered to determine if this committee should be added to the active list and its agendas included for posting.
7. Consider allowing the staff contacts in each Department to have access to update the information directly rather than relying on Municipal Clerk staff for updates necessary as committee vacancies, appointments or staffing responsibilities change.

Recommended Responsible Parties: Municipal Clerk; Information Services; City Attorney.

Table 2 lists all 59 Boards, Committees and Commissions by Status

Table 2. City Council/Mayor Appoints Members to the following Committees

| # | Name | On-Line Presence | Status | Status Count | Agency staffing or Department staffing |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------------------|--------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1 | Transportation Policy Board for the El Paso Urban Transportation Study (1) | A to Z | Active- External | 1 | MPO |
| 2 | Central Appraisal District Board of Directors (1) | A to Z | Active- External | 2 | El Paso Central Appraisal District |
| 3 | Housing Authority Board of Commissioners | A to Z | Active- External | 3 | Housing Authority of the City of El Paso (HACEP) |
| 4 | El Paso Housing Finance Corporation (1) | A to Z | Active- External | 4 | El Paso Housing Finance Corporation |
| 5 | Public Service Board | A to Z | Active- External | 5 | EPWU-PSB |
| 6 | Public Service Board Selection Committee | A to Z | Active- External | 6 | EPWU-PSB |
| 7 | Stormwater Master Plan Community Advisory Committee | A to Z | Active- External | 7 | EPWU-PSB |
| 8 | Fire And Police Pension Fund Board of Trustees | A to Z | Active- External | 8 | Fire and Police Pension Fund |
| 9 | City Employees Pension Fund Board of Trustees | A to Z | Active- External | 9 | Pension Office |
| 10 | El Paso County 911 District Board of Managers | A to Z | Active- External | 11 | Fire |
| 11 | Camino Real Regional Mobility Authority – RMA | A to Z | Active- External with internal support | 1 | Camino Real Regional Mobility Authority – RMA in partnership with Municipal Clerk |
| 12 | Building and Standards Commission | A to Z | ACTIVE | 1 | Planning & Inspections (P&I) |
| 13 | Capital Improvements Advisory Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 2 | (P&I) |
| 14 | City Plan Commission | A to Z | ACTIVE | 3 | (P&I) |
| 15 | Construction Board of Appeals | A to Z | ACTIVE | 4 | (P&I) |
| 16 | Open Space Advisory Board | A to Z | ACTIVE | 5 | (P&I) |
| 17 | Zoning Board of Adjustment | A to Z | ACTIVE | 6 | (P&I) |
| 18 | Community Development Steering Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 7 | Community and Human Development (CD) |
| 19 | Fair Housing Task Force | A to Z | ACTIVE | 8 | (CD) |
| 20 | Foster Grandparent Program Advisory Council | A to Z | ACTIVE | 9 | (CD) |
| 21 | Retired and Senior Volunteer Program Advisory Council – RSVP | A to Z | ACTIVE | 10 | (CD) |
| 22 | Veteran's Affairs Advisory Committee | A to Z & Meetings | ACTIVE | 11 | (CD) |

| | | | | | |
|----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------|----------------|----|-----------------------------------------------|
| 23 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No. 5 | A to Z | ACTIVE | 12 | Economic Development (ED) |
| 24 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No. 6 | A to Z | ACTIVE | 13 | (ED) |
| 25 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No. 7 | A to Z | ACTIVE | 14 | (ED) |
| 26 | Historic Landmark Commission | A to Z | ACTIVE | 15 | (ED) |
| 27 | Mexican American Cultural Center Sub-Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 16 | Museums and Cultural Affairs (MCAD) |
| 28 | Museums and Cultural Affairs Advisory Board (MCAAB) | A to Z | ACTIVE | 17 | (MCAD) |
| 29 | Public Art Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 18 | (MCAD) |
| 30 | Citizen's Advisory Committee for the Board of the Mass Transit Department | A to Z | ACTIVE | 19 | Sun Metro Mass Transit |
| 31 | City Accessibility Advisory Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 20 | Sun Metro |
| 32 | Bicycle Advisory Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 21 | Capital Improvement Dept. (CID) |
| 33 | El Paso Bond Overview Advisory Committee (BOAC) | A to Z | ACTIVE | 22 | (CID) |
| 34 | Ethics Review Commission | A to Z | ACTIVE | 23 | City Attorney |
| 35 | Greater El Paso Civic, Convention and Tourism Advisory Board | A to Z | ACTIVE | 24 | Destination El Paso |
| 36 | Animal Shelter Advisory Committee | A to Z | ACTIVE | 25 | Animal Services |
| 37 | Civil Service Commission | A to Z & Meetings | ACTIVE | 26 | Human Resources |
| 38 | Financial & Audit Oversight Committee | Meetings | ACTIVE | 27 | Internal Audit |
| 39 | Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council | A to Z | ACTIVE | 28 | Office of Resilience and Sustainability (ORS) |
| 40 | Parks & Recreation Advisory Board | A to Z | ACTIVE | 29 | Parks and Recreation |
| 41 | Mass Transit Department Board Meeting | Meetings | ACTIVE | 30 | Sun Metro |
| 42 | Downtown Development Corporation | Meetings | ACTIVE | 31 | City Manager |
| 43 | Tax Advisory Committee | NONE | ACTIVE | 32 | Tax Office |
| 44 | Committee on Border Relations | A to Z | Active-Dormant | 1 | Council and Mayor |
| 45 | Industrial Development Authority | A to Z | Active-Dormant | 2 | Economic Development |
| 46 | Ad Hoc Charter Advisory Committee | A to Z & Meetings | Inactive | 1 | City Manager/City Attorney |
| 47 | Revolving Loan Fund Board | A to Z | Inactive | 2 | Economic Development |
| 48 | Ad Hoc Committee on Annexation | Meetings | Inactive | 3 | Planning and Inspections |

| | | | | | |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|----------|----|-------------------------------------|
| 49 | Ad Hoc Blue Ribbon Committee on Regional Parks | Meetings | Inactive | 4 | Planning and Inspections |
| 50 | Ad Hoc Committee – Incentive Policy | Meetings | Inactive | 5 | Planning and Inspections |
| 51 | Districting Commission | A to Z | Inactive | 6 | Planning and Inspections |
| 52 | Animal Welfare Advisory Committee | A to Z | Inactive | 7 | Environmental Services |
| 53 | City of El Paso Advisory Committee on Public Service (PSB) Land Management | A to Z | Inactive | 8 | |
| 54 | El Paso Mountain Committee | A to Z | Inactive | 9 | |
| 55 | International Bridge Commission | A to Z | Inactive | 10 | |
| 56 | PTSES Advisory Board | A to Z | Inactive | 11 | |
| 57 | Public Utility Regulation Board | A to Z | Inactive | 12 | City Manager |
| 58 | Tree Board | A to Z | Inactive | 13 | |
| 59 | CITY OF EL PASO PROPERTY FINANCE AUTHORITY, INC. BOARD OF DIRECTORS | A to Z | Inactive | 14 | El Paso Housing Finance Corporation |

Once the externally staffed and Inactive Boards & Committees are properly categorized, the list totals 34 Active Committees staffed by City Departments, 1 Active committee for an external body that is staffed internally (CRRMA staffed by Municipal Clerk staff) and 14 inactive boards and committees. Of these, 2 are considered dormant. Externally staffed Committees were not asked to participate in a survey of issue areas and are not part of this report after this section. Additionally, No. 43 on the list, the Tax Advisory Board, may need to be added to the on-line listing and their agendas may need to be posted per the Texas Open Meetings Act; follow up on this Committee is needed to determine its status and proper placement.

2. Total number of Committees

The number of Committees—and possible efficiencies that can be achieved by analyzing meeting frequency for these and where issue areas may complement work of other Committees—as well as clearly sun-setting those Committees that are no longer active is one of the concerns. Of the remaining committees, there is a possibility for efficiencies or joint meetings if it is determined the function served is not a direct service to clients and where the Committee is not mandated by state law or the City Charter. Table 3 below notes which Committees may be reviewed for possible efficiencies/joint meetings.

Table 3. Possible Efficiencies by Committee

| Committee Name | Department | Recommendation |
|---------------------------------------------|------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Open Space Advisory Board | Planning & Inspections | Consider incorporating issue areas as part of the City Plan Commission or the Parks & Recreation Advisory Committee or joint meetings |
| Foster Grandparent Program Advisory Council | Community Development | Consider joint meeting with Retired Senior Volunteer Program based on meeting frequency |

| | | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Retired and Senior Volunteer Program Advisory Council – RSVP | Community Development | Consider joint meeting with Foster Grandparent Program |
| Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No. 5 | Economic Development (ED) | Consider meeting frequency and possibly joint meeting with other TIRZs |
| Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No.6 | Economic Development (ED) | See above |
| Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No.7 | Economic Development (ED) | See above |
| Public Art Committee | Museums and Cultural Affairs | Consider as a sub-committee of Museums and Cultural Affairs Advisory Board |

As a recommendation, a review of the possible efficiencies outlined in this section should be done between the City Attorney's Office and the respective Department staffing each listed committee. The timetable for this review should take about six months. An additional two to four months will allow whatever amendments need to be instituted to be crafted and presented to City Council for adoption, should this section be carried forward to implementation.

Anytime a new Committee is proposed Council should seriously consider if the issue area is one that can be addressed by an existing Committee. This will avoid the duplication of effort between Committees and Department staff. It should be noted that the three newest Committees created over the last 2 years have had issues with member appointments and each has taken at least 6 months to have all appointments made. Additional details regarding appointments and re-appointments are discussed elsewhere in this report.

There are currently a total of 32 active committees staffed by 15 of 27 City Departments. Of the active committees, two (2) are mandated by the state of Texas, 6 are created by resolutions, 18 are mandated by city ordinance, and four are stated as other (i.e. Federal requirement or Inter local agreement). There are various departments that serve direct customer requests—mostly in the Planning & Inspection Department—therefore appointments to these state mandated and customer-focused Committees should be a priority.

The following is a list of City Departments that staff Committees, listed in descending order from the most number of committees to the least number of committees.

| Department/No. of Committees Staffed | Committees |
|--------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Planning and Inspections – 6 | (1) Building and Standards Commission; (2) Capital Improvements Advisory Committee; (3) City Plan Commission; (4) Construction Board of Appeals; (5) Open Space Advisory Board; (6) Zoning Board of Adjustment |
| Community and Human Development – 5 | (1) Community Development Steering Committee; (2) Fair Housing Task Force; (3) Foster Grandparent Program Advisory Council; (4) Retired and Senior Volunteer Program Advisory Council – RSVP; (5) Veteran's Affairs Advisory Committee |
| Economic Development – 4 | (1) Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone number 5; (2) Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone number 6; (3) Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone number 7; (4) Historic Landmark Commission |
| Museums and Cultural Affairs | (1) Mexican American Cultural Center Sub-Committee (formerly Hispanic |

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| – 3 | Cultural Center Subcommittee); (2) Museums and Cultural Affairs Advisory Board (MCAAB); (3) Public Art Committee |
| Sun Metro Mass Transit – 3 | (1) Citizen's Advisory Committee for the Board of the Mass Transit Department; (2) City Accessibility Advisory Committee; (3) Mass Transit Department Board |
| Capital Improvement – 2 | (1) Bicycle Advisory Committee; (2) El Paso Bond Overview Advisory Committee (BOAC) |
| City Attorney – 1 | Ethics Review Commission |
| City Manager's Office, Office of Resiliency (non-departmental) – 1 | Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council |
| Destination El Paso – 1 | Greater El Paso Civic, Convention and Tourism Advisory Board |
| Animal Services – 1 | Animal Shelter Advisory Committee |
| Human Resources – 1 | Civil Service Commission |
| Non-Departmental / Internal Audit – 1 | Financial and Audit Oversight Committee |
| Parks and Recreation – 1 | Parks and Recreation Advisory Board |
| Tax Office – 1 | Tax Advisory Committee |
| Municipal Clerk – 1 | Camino Real Regional Mobility Authority |

Departments that do not staff any Committees: Aviation; Municipal Court; Streets & Maintenance; Environmental Services; Information Technology; International Bridges; Library; OMB; Police; Fire; Public Health; Purchasing & Strategic Sourcing; Zoo.

A key recommendation is to build a roadmap for improving the overlapping of boards and committees and to make sure committees that need to be sunsetted are formally sunsetted. Since quorum is an issue due to the stagnant process in appointing members, an easily-usable repository of citizens interested in serving on a committee should be created.

It is suggested, in order to make sure committees' goals are continuously aligned with the Strategic Plan; each committee should adopt additional bylaws that require them to meet at least once a year. The benefit of this yearly meeting would bring committee members, department staff, and legal staff together, and would allow members to be trained, retrained and obtain refresher training on topics such as ethics, sexual harassment, or legal issues.

Possible Recommendations:

1. Clearly note which committees are Active and Inactive on Main webpage list with an Active/Dormant note.
2. Note which Active Committees are staffed by external agencies with an “*” notation.
3. On the Information Page for each committee, add a line that notes if the Board & Committee is going to be sunsetted at a certain period in time.
4. Update the information on the Boards & Committees every 6 months to capture if a Committee is being staffed by a different Department. For example and on a good note, this year the Animal Services Committee moved from Environmental Services to the new Animal Services Department. If it wasn't for the work on Boards & Committees, this information may not have been captured and updated on the city's on-line presence.
5. Additional work to analyze the meeting frequency of some Committee may need to be completed.

Recommended Responsible Parties: Municipal Clerk, Information Technology, and each Department that staff Committees

3. Committees with Direct Service Impact to Citizens/State Mandate

There are several Committees that provide direct services to citizens through their actions. The following Committees provide a direct service and therefore prioritizing these to have appointments quickly made is recommended.

| No. | Committee Name | Department Staffing | Direct Services |
|-----|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------|
| 1 | Building and Standards Commission | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 2 | City Plan Commission | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 3 | City Review Committee (CRC) | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 4 | Construction Board of Appeals | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 5 | Historic Landmark Commission | Economic Development | Yes |
| 6 | Zoning Board of Adjustment | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 7 | Ethics Review Commission | City Attorney | Yes |
| 8 | Civil Service Commission | Human Resources | Yes |

Possible Recommendations:

1. Prioritize filling vacancies for these committees to improve upon customer services to the public.
2. Make the interest form data available to City council representatives in a searchable format.

Recommended Responsible Parties: City Council Representatives, Information Technology

4. Appointments, Vacancies and Quorum

Appointments

A significant concern is appointments to Committees and the time it takes to make all the appointments for new committees as well as to address vacancies in existing Committees. The number of vacancies has contributed to making quorum difficult for several Committees resulting in a lack of progress and in some instances in disgruntled citizens who had direct requests pending before a Committee and no action on their requests could be made as the meeting had to be cancelled.

Three New Committees and Appointments

| Committee | Creation Date | Date of First Appointee | Date of Last Appointee | Date of First Meeting | Time from Creation to First Meeting |
|--------------------------------------------|------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Bicycle Advisory Committee | May 20, 2014 | May 27, 2014 | February 9, 2015 | October 29, 2014 | 5 months |
| Veterans Affairs Advisory Committee | May 5, 2015 | May 21, 2015 | October 20, 2015 | October 12, 2015 | 5 months |
| Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council | January 26, 2016 | February 9, 2016 | March 8, 2016 | NONE-only 2 of 9 appointees | 5+ months |

For existing Committees, when vacancies occur, making timely appointments in order to have a full Committee is also a concern. A survey conducted in spring 2016 of staff that are responsible for Committee meetings identified that vacancies and absences caused meeting cancellations.

Vacancies

For vacancies once a term is expired, it is also time consuming for staff working on these to follow up when several reminders have to be sent to appointing bodies. Nine (9) of thirty (30) committees that responded to the survey stated that they had no vacancies, both from members and alternates on Committees. As appointments are made each Council meeting, the numbers fluctuate, but this is a good snapshot of what is found on a typical month with over 25% of committees reporting vacancies. At the time of the survey, this was the list of Committees with vacancies.

| Count | Board & Committee Name | Department staffing | Vacancies |
|-------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 1 | Building and Standards Commission | Planning & Inspections (P&I) | Yes |
| 2 | Capital Improvements Advisory Committee | (P&I) | Yes |
| 3 | City Plan Commission | (P&I) | No |
| 4 | Construction Board of Appeals | (P&I) | Yes |
| 5 | Open Space Advisory Board | (P&I) | No |
| 6 | Zoning Board of Adjustment | (P&I) | Yes |
| 7 | Community Development Steering Committee | Community & Human Development (CD) | No |
| 8 | Fair Housing Task Force | (CD) | Yes |
| 9 | Foster Grandparent Program Advisory Council | (CD) | Yes |
| 10 | Retired and Senior Volunteer Program Advisory Council – RSVP | (CD) | Yes |
| 11 | Veteran's Affairs Advisory Committee | (CD) | Yes |
| 12 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No. 5 | Economic and International Development (ED) | Yes |
| 13 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No.6 | (ED) | Yes |
| 14 | Tax Increment Reinvestment Zone No.7 | (ED) | Yes |
| 15 | Historic Landmark Commission | (ED) | Yes |
| 16 | Mexican American Cultural Center Sub-Committee | Museums and Cultural Affairs (MCAD) | No |
| 17 | Museums and Cultural Affairs Advisory Board (MCAAB) | (MCAD) | Yes |
| 18 | Public Art Committee | (MCAD) | Yes |
| 19 | Citizen's Advisory Committee for the Board of the Mass Transit Department | Sun Metro Mass Transit | Yes |
| 20 | City Accessibility Advisory Committee | Sun Metro | Yes |
| 21 | Mass Transit Department Board Meeting (City Council meets as Board-no survey) | Sun Metro | No |
| 22 | Bicycle Advisory Committee | Capital Improvement Dept. (CID) | No |
| 23 | EI Paso Bond Overview Advisory Committee (BOAC) | (CID) | No |
| 24 | Ethics Review Commission | City Attorney | No |

| | | | |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------|-----|
| 25 | Greater El Paso Civic, Convention and Tourism Advisory Board | Destination El Paso | Yes |
| 26 | Animal Shelter Advisory Committee | Animal Services | Yes |
| 27 | Civil Service Commission | Human Resources | Yes |
| 28 | Financial and Audit Oversight Committee | Internal Audit | No |
| 29 | Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council | Office of Resilience & Sustainability (ORS) | Yes |
| 30 | Parks and Recreation Advisory Board | Parks and Recreation | Yes |

The survey also highlighted that 15 Committees had appointments that were not filled in a timely manner, with 12 indicating this caused an issue with meeting quorum, thus resulting in either meetings being cancelled or leaving projects at a standstill. For example, the Ethics Committee did not have all appointments for over two years and the committee had not met for two years until a few months ago. This resulted in projects or important issues not moving forward with input from the necessary committees. The survey responses showed that 21 committees had 1 or more member vacancies. Eight committees have a current vacancy (vacant less than 2 months), 6 committees with long term vacancies (vacancy available for at least 2 months), and 7 committees with long term vacancies (vacancy available for 2+ years).

Absences have also contributed to quorum concerns. Four committees have had members miss meetings for various reasons impacting quorum, thus infringing on the Committees' abilities to conduct business.

Recommendations:

1. Making the Committees Appointment Interest form on the Municipal Clerk's webpage more prominent, revising it to fit more committees with particular needs, making the database sortable by most fields entered and having all Council Representatives and the staff that work on Committees have internal access to it with the ability to sort and cross-tabulate fields. Whenever a vacancy occurs, have staff request or access the database with searchable criteria. For example, provide the information for all appointment interest forms from individuals that reside in a certain district and are attorneys. As previously recommended, the IT and City Clerk's office should make the appointment interest form to serve on committees more interactive by creating a banner on the Municipal Clerk page that can be clicked on, leading the interested party to the form. Add a line item to the form to note "any" as an option for interested parties in case individuals are interested in more than 1 Committee. Consider revising this information to include the information in attachment 1 (Application for Appointment to Boards/Committees/Commissions.)
2. For Committees with 2 year terms, revise to allow for 4 year terms. The 2 year terms reflect a time when Council member's own terms were 2 years. Now that 4 year terms are in place, Committee appointees can serve the same length of time to allow for consistency.
3. For Committees with constrictive membership requirements, revising the category of membership to allow a broader spectrum of eligible members will help broaden the depth of potential members. For example, instead of calling for a "Realtor" on the board, calling for a realtor or similar experience and instead of an "Accountant" calling for someone with financial or accounting experience.
4. Encourage all the Neighborhood Leadership Academy graduates from the Neighborhood Services-Community and Human Development Dept. fill out an appointment interest form prior to graduation. Have the Neighborhood Services staff send out an annual call for appointment

interest forms for all graduates to be filled out and remind Council members that the call for appointment interest forms has been sent out and that a revised list of candidates for appointment is available.

5. Use the media to have a bi-annual call to serve on committees to be advertised that there are various committees that need volunteers to serve by inviting the public to fill out appointment interest forms.

Recommended Responsible parties: Municipal Clerk, Information Technology, Community and Human Development Dept, Public Information Office, City Attorney, Each Department that is responsible for a Committee needs to review terms to see if revisions are necessary

5. Training Needs

In keeping with city standards, members appointed to a committee need to take the ethics and sexual harassment training. Initial training should be done when first appointed and then refresher training conducted every three years after that. In addition, if the board does not currently have separate bylaws from their creating document, bylaws should be adopted. Within these bylaws, committees should require an annual meeting to take place and use the opportunity to train new members and provide a refresher course to sitting members about their duties, roles, and responsibilities on the committee or provide the compliance with required training information so that individual appointees are aware if they need to take the required trainings. At this time, the City Attorney's office can use the opportunity to provide training on the legal responsibilities of members, such as responsibilities under the Open Meetings Act. In addition, the list noting which Committees require members to take these trainings needs to be updated by the City Attorney's office so reflect the active Committees since the existing list includes various Committees that are sunsetted.

In staying within city standards, administrative staff should also be trained about their responsibilities both as a civil servant and about what is legally expected of staff, such as the Texas Open Meetings Act and the Texas Open Records Act, for their committee work. Annually, staff responsible for working with a committee may receive training from the City Attorney's office on the responsibilities of the staffing Committees, with additional training provided in each department for the idiosyncrasies of each Committee. An annual certification that the staff working on each Committee has received training may be tracked by the City Attorney's Office for compliance purposes, if this kind of certification is deemed necessary.

To remain consistent, training staff on re-appointment and hold over processes is recommended. The 30-day hold over when an appointee's term is over applies in some cases and should be a key training point for staff in notifying Council members that a vacancy exists. The Department that staffs the board or commission needs to advise appointing Council member(s) if the hold over period applies. In addition, the supporting department needs to alert the Municipal Clerk's office to remove the board member whose term has expired from the membership roster on the webpage in a timely manner. In this instance, having more department contacts be able to directly update the on-line information may be helpful rather than contacting the repository department to update the information.

Possible Recommendations:

1. Annual training of Committee members and annual certification of training submitted to City Attorney and Municipal Clerk Office by each department to include ethics and sexual harassment training.
2. Annual certification that staff working with Committees has been trained on their roles and responsibilities to be submitted annually to the City Attorney's office.

3. Assign responsibility to Departments for alerting the Municipal Clerk annually to the name of the staff member assigned to staff the board or commission.

Recommended Responsible parties: Municipal Clerk, City Attorney, each Department responsible for a Committee

6. Administrative Needs/Staffing

When it comes to the amount of staff time devoted to each committee, data shows that it depends on the committee and the type of projects they are working on. There are approximately 89 City staff members who devote their time to committees, with hours ranging from 2 hours to 48 hours preparing before and after each meeting or project. The average staff time would be approximately 20 hours per committee meeting, with the least amount of time being 2 hours per week and the most time being 48 hours per case. There are currently 22 committees that meet on a monthly basis, 7 that meet quarterly, 4 that meet as needed, 2 that meet bi-weekly, 1 that meets bi-monthly, and 1 that meets semi-annually.

Recommendations

1. If a Committee work allows, have Committees meet every other month unless there are particular needs for meeting more often.
2. If a new Committee is proposed to be created, examine the current Active Committees and determine if one of those may be able to handle the tasks expected of the proposed new Committee. If this is the case, assign the work to an existing Committee rather than create a new Committee knowing that some new Committees may still be necessary.

CONCLUSION

The vital role that citizen volunteers serving on City Committees is very important to recognize. In order to overcome the current challenges with Committees, the recommendations in this report can add efficiency to the functions related to most Committees and improve the services provided to our City.

Additional overall possible recommendations:

1. On-line provide an overview of all the committees on which citizens can serve and the board or committee's scope of work. This overview can also serve as an information resource for Council members as they make appointments. The Municipal Clerk's office can update this document annually.
2. Provide training tools on-line as much as possible, including training videos for the staff and Committee members, to make training easier and more convenient for the Committee members volunteering their valuable time. Human Resources should take the lead on this training.
3. Provide a Directory of Boards and Committees to each Department and Council members that includes brief blurbs on each Committee that may serve as a resource for appointees and citizens interested in serving on a Committee. Have this document on-line as well and when the Public Information office does press release for interest forms, have that available on line as an additional resource. Human Resources may take on the responsibility of this document similar to what other municipalities provide.