



DISTRICTING COMMISSION MEETING

March 16, 2022

4:00 P.M.

MINUTES

The meeting was called to order at 4:10 p.m.

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:

Col. Bob Burns
Dr. Michiel Noe
Christopher Villa
Joshua Fematt - Online
Martin Bartlett
Daniel Anchondo – Late, arrived 4:44 pm
Isabel Carrillo
Cynthia Renteria
Gilbert Esparza III – Online, left at 6:43 pm

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:

NONE

City Staff:

Karina Brasgalla, Executive Secretary, Assistant Director Economic and International Development; Kevin Smith, Planning and Inspections Assistant Director; Russell Abeln, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office; Mariano Soto, Planning and Inspections GIS Senior Planner

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

Call to the Public will begin at 5:00 p.m. Members of the public will be allowed 5 minutes to present, with additional time granted at the discretion of the presiding officer.

Ms. Carol Wallace (President, The League of Women Voters): commented on the League's goals and process

Mr. Jesus Valdez: clarified the ranked choice voting process, commented regarding cracking

Mr. Ed Talamantes: commented regarding the Mission Valley's representation

Ms. Sylvia Carreon: presented neighborhood associations in El Paso. Voiced support for Vice Chair Carrillo's map, Ms. Carmen Rodriguez's map, and Commissioner Esparza's map. Felt District 6's needs were not being met.

Ms. Laurie Cooper: asked for her maps to be edited and several precincts to be moved: Public Maps #6A-D Precincts 152 & 153 move to District 6, Precincts 121 & 122 move to District 7. Commented regarding neighborhood associations and representation

Ms. Najera: Asked that folks reach out to their neighborhood associations so they can work together, commended League of Women Voters for their work

DR. NOE MOVED TO RETURN TO THE AGENDA, COMMISSIONER RENTERIA SECONDED, MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

.....

II. **REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION:**

- 1 Discussion and Action: Changes to the Agenda

No Action

- 2 Information, Discussion and Action: Review of the minutes for February 23, 2022

DR. NOE MOTIONED TO ACCEPT THE MINUTES, COL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION CARRIES UNANIMOUSLY

- 3 Information and Discussion: Updates on Board administration and Public Comment Submitted Electronically

Ms. Brasgalla noted that the Commission had printouts of prior comment, read most recent Public Comments into the record: Mr. Peter Capenga; Ms. Carol S. Wallace, League of Women Voters

Ms. Brasgalla reminded the Commission on the timeline

Chair Bartlett asked for a reiteration of the deadline

Ms. Brasgalla noted that on April 4 the item for City Council work session on April 11 would be posted. April 6 finalize report to City Council, March 30 final map recommendation

- 4 Information, Discussion, and Action: Drafting and Selection of District Plans.

Ms. Brasgalla noted that paper maps could be provided to all Commissioners

Chair Bartlett noted that a motion would be needed to recess until all Commissions had maps

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED, VICE CHAIR CARRILLO SECONDED, MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

MS. BRASGALLA NOTED THAT THE MEETING WAS RECESSED AT 4:16.

Chair Bartlett asked for a motion to come out of recess.

COMMISSIONER NOE MOTIONED, COLONEL BURNS SECONDED, MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

CAME OUT OF RECESS AT ~4:25.

Chair Bartlett commented about the process, noted recurring themes on maps

Vice Chair Carrillo commented on Ranked Choice Voting – voting for what they like rather than against what they don't

Commissioner Renteria clarified that Map #7 looks different online than in paper – error or intentional?

Ms. Brasgalla said probably an error

Colonel Burns noted that it was probably irrelevant

Commissioner Renteria asked that they consider that one online rather than on paper

Colonel Burns agreed with Vice Chair Carrillo on ranked choice voting

Staff and Commission discussed voting styles

Colonel Burns noted that Commissioner Map #3 could be removed

Ms. Brasgalla asked if there was a motion; see (b.)

Colonel Burns asked that another draft of his, a variation on Commissioner Map #7, be considered.
See (f.)

Vice Chair Carrillo asked for clarification of the process

Chair Bartlett clarified

Ms. Brasgalla clarified further

Discussion regarding moving to a ranked choice voting model to proceed

VICE CHAIR CARRILLO MOTIONED TO RECONSIDER ALL MAPS AND USE RANKED CHOICE VOTING TO PROCEED. COLONEL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION PASSED WITH CHAIR BARTLETT VOTING NAY

Ms. Brasgalla asked if there were any maps the Commission would like to examine before ranking their top three choices. Heard none.

Colonel Burns asked a question regarding his edited map

Ms. Brasgalla responded clarifying the deadlines and the process

Commissioner Villa commented regarding Colonel Burn's map

Commissioner Renteria asked to clarify if they were going to proceed with ranked choice voting

Further discussion on the process by Commissioners Esparza and Villa, comments by Chair Bartlett

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED TO MOVE TO PUBLIC COMMENT, COMMISSIONER VILLA SECONDED. MOTION PASSED, MOVED TO PUBLIC COMMENT

Returned from Public Comment

Ms. Brasgalla reminded the Commission of the motion to proceed with ranked choice voting

Commissioner Villa commented

VICE CHAIR CARRILLO ASKED TO MOTION TO GO TO RANKED CHOICE VOTING AFTER ELIMINATING SOME OF THE EXISTING MAPS INSTEAD OF THE ORIGINAL MOTION. COLONEL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION PASSED 6-3 WITH CHAIR BARTLETT, COMMISSIONER VILLA, COMMISSIONER RENTERIA AGAINST.

Kevin Smith commented about forward progress, noted the deadline

Commissioner Renteria asked to clarify next steps

Mr. Smith recommended going through each map and removing those they did not want to edit

Ms. Brasgalla clarified further

Colonel Burns commented

Dr. Noe asked a question

Ms. Brasgalla and Mr. Smith responded

Chair Bartlett commented

Colonel Burns asked regarding his revisions

Mr. Smith made a staff recommendation

Vice Chair Carrillo asked the same

- a. Commissioner Map #2 (Submitted by Commissioner Carrillo)

Discussion on similarities to other maps

Vice Chair Carrillo indicated that she was open to removing her map from consideration

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE COMMISSIONER MAP #2 FROM CONSIDERATION, COMMISSIONER ESPARZA SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Following discussion after Public Comment, this map was returned to consideration

- b. Commissioner Map #3 (Submitted by Commissioner Burns)

COMMISSIONER BURNS MOTIONED TO REMOVE COMMISSIONER MAP #3 FROM CONSIDERATION, COMMISSIONER RENTERIA SECONDED, PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Following discussion after Public Comment, another motion was made to remove this map from consideration

COLONEL BURNS MOTIONED TO REMOVE COMMISSIONER MAP #3 FROM CONSIDERATION, COMMISSIONER RENTERIA SECONDED. COLONEL BURNS NOTED THIS MAP'S SIMILARITY TO COMMISSIONER MAP #6. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- c. Commissioner Map #4 (Submitted by Commissioner Villa)

Following Public Comment:

Commissioner Villa commented that with revisions, this map became very similar to the revised version of Commissioner Map #7.

Colonel Burns asked to look at the two maps side by side

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE COMMISSIONER MAP #4 FROM CONSIDERATION. COMMISSIONER ESPARZA SECONDED. MOTION PASSED WITH DR. NOE AGAINST.

- d. Commissioner Map #5 (Submitted by Commissioner Bartlett)

CHAIR BARTLETT ASKED FOR A MOTION TO REMOVED COMMISSIONER MAP #5 FROM CONSIDERATION IN FAVOR OF COMMISSIONER MAP #8. COMMISSIONER ANCHONDO MOTIONED, VICE CHAIR CARRILLO SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- e. Commissioner Map #6 (Submitted by Commissioner Esparza)

No action in first round following Public Comment

- f. Commissioner Map #7 (Submitted by Commissioner Burns)

Chair Bartlett asked for a motion to accept Commissioner Map #7 with an option to edit – **MOTION WAS MADE TO ADVANCE COMMISSIONER MAPS #4, 5, 6, AND 7 WITH AN OPTION TO EDIT.**

MOTIONED BY DR. NOE, SECONDED BY COLONEL BURNS. MOTION PASSES 6-2 WITH VICE CHAIR CARRILLO AND COMMISSIONER RENTERIA AGAINST.

Following Public Comment:

Colonel Burns commented regarding his revisions

Vice Chair Carrillo asked this map not be removed – no action in first round following Public Comment

- g. Commissioner Map #8 (Submitted by Commissioner Renteria)

No action in first round following Public Comment

- h. Public Map #1A (Submitted by the League of Women Voters)

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #1-A FROM CONSIDERATION, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ESPARZA. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- i. Public Map #1B (Submitted by the League of Women Voters)

VICE CHAIR CARRILLO MOTIONED TO REMOVED PUBLIC MAP #1-B FROM CONSIDERATION, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RENTERIA. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- j. Public Map #2 (Submitted by Johnny Ruffier)

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #2 FROM CONSIDERATION, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ESPARZA. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- k. Public Map #3 (Submitted by Julian Quinonez)

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #3 FROM CONSIDERATION, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RENTERIA. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- l. Public Map #4 (Submitted by the League of Women Voters)

COLONEL BURNS MOTIONED TO REMOVED PUBLIC MAP #4 FROM CONSIDERATION, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ESPARZA. MOTION PASSED 5-4 WITH VICE CHAIR CARRILLO, CHAIR BARTLETT, COMMISSIONER NOE AND COMMISSIONER RENTERIA AGAINST

Commissioner Villa made a comment regarding his vote

- m. Public Map #5 (Submitted by Julian Quinonez)

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #5 FROM CONSIDERATION, COLONEL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- n. Public Map #6A (Submitted by Laurie Cooper)

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #6A FROM CONSIDERATION, SEVERAL SECONDED. MOTION PASSED WITH COMMISSIONER ANCHONDO OPPOSED

- o. Public Map #6B (Submitted by Laurie Cooper)

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVED PUBLIC MAP #6B FROM CONSIDERATION, VICE CHAIR CARRILLO SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.

Colonel Burns asked Mr. Russel Abeln if this map constituted “cracking”.

Mr. Abeln said no, it would not be

Ms. Brasgalla also commented regarding “packing” and “cracking”

- p. Public Map #6C (Submitted by Laurie Cooper)

COMMISSIONER VILLA MOTIONED TO REMOVE PUBLIC MAP #6C FROM CONSIDERATION, VICE CHAIR CARRILLO SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

- q. Public Map #6D (Submitted by Laurie Cooper)

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED TO REMOVED PUBLIC MAP #6D FROM CONSIDERATION, COLONEL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION PASSED WITH COMMISSIONER ANCHONDO OPPOSED

Commissioner Villa asked for a review of the maps still standing

Ms. Brasgalla recapped the votes – Commissioner Maps #2, 6, 7, 8 remained

Commissioner Renteria asked to compare Public Map #4 with her map in the discussion process

Ms. Brasgalla confirmed the method to proceed with evaluating maps

- e. Mr. Mariano Soto presented Commissioner Map #6 for editing

Commissioner Esparza commented on his map

Colonel Burns commented on Commissioner Map #6

Commissioner Esparza responded

Chair Bartlett asked several questions, asked to make 54 a boundary line

Staff made the requested changes

Commissioner Renteria commented regarding central El Paso

Commissioner Villa made a recommendation

Ms. Brasgalla commented
Several revisions were made, deviation was too high

Commissioner Renteria asked for further edits
With those edits, deviation was much lower
Commissioner Renteria asked for clarification whether action was needed
Ms. Brasgalla recommended action once editing was finished before ranked choice
Commissioner Villa asked a question regarding deviation

MOTION TO ACCEPT THE EDITED COMMISSIONER MAP #6, SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ESPARZA. MOTION PASSES WITH COMMISSIONER ANCHONDO AGAINST.

Commissioner Anchondo asked if they would keep both the original and the revision
Ms. Brasgalla clarified that both were kept, noted that a motion would need to be made to remove the original draft from consideration

COMMISSIONER RENTERIA MOTIONED TO REMOVE THE ORIGINAL COMMISSIONER MAP #6, KEEP THE EDITED VERSION. VICE CHAIR CARRILLO SECONDED. MOTION PASSED WITH COMMISSIONER ANCHONDO AGAINST

Ms. Brasgalla noted that maps can be brought back to consider before ranked choice voting for comparison.

- a. Mr. Soto pulled up Commissioner Map #2 for consideration
Vice Chair Carrillo commented on the map, explained revisions including renumbering districts and moving some precincts

Dr. Noe made a comment asking if this map affected any representatives
Ms. Brasgalla responded
Mr. Smith also commented regarding representatives
Vice Chair Carrillo made further changes
Commissioner Renteria commented regarding representatives

Chair Bartlett asked Mr. Abeln about guideline permissiveness
Mr. Abeln responded

Vice Chair Carrillo checked the edits, spoke regarding her map
Chair Bartlett asked for an edit
Commissioner Anchondo made a comment
Vice Chair Carrillo responded
Commissioner Anchondo made another comment regarding representatives
Mr. Smith responded
Dr. Noe and Vice Chair Carrillo discussed representation
Commissioner Renteria also commented on representation

Ms. Brasgalla presented numbers for the edited draft of Commissioner Map #2
Vice Chair Carrillo made further edits to bring down deviation

Commissioner Esparza asked a question regarding voting, left the meeting
Commissioner Renteria commented regarding the fairness of the maps
Vice Chair Carrillo responded

Commissioner Renteria asked if they could finish this map tonight, do edits to the other two maps at next session
Ms. Brasgalla responded yes

Vice Chair Carrillo and Ms. Brasgalla worked on more edits to Commissioner Map #2
Vice Chair Carrillo asked to pause editing for the time being

Chair Bartlett asked if they stopped here, they could still meet deadlines
Mr. Smith and Ms. Brasgalla responded with the dates and timeline
Commissioner Renteria asked a question
Chair Bartlett asked for further action on Item 4

Commissioner Map #2, #7, and #8 remain to be edited – no motions at this time

5 Discussion: Identify Items for Future Agendas

Ms. Brasgalla noted the agenda would be similar, with fewer maps to edit.
Commissioner Renteria asked if Commissioner Map #2 would continue to be edited next week
Vice Chair Carrillo responded that she would send further edits to staff
Ms. Brasgalla noted that this would be a pause in editing Commissioner Map #2, would resume next week

6 Adjournment

DR. NOE MOVED TO ADJOURN, COLONEL BURNS SECONDED. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY
ADJOURNED AT APPROXIMATELY 6:55 PM