



Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council (RREAC)

Mayor

Oscar Leaser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

MEETING NOTES, FEBRUARY 14, 2017

Attendance

Name	District	Position	Present
Frederic Dalbin	Mayor	Member	x
Ernest Eisenberg	1	Member	x
Crystal Arrieta	2	Member	Not present
Shelby Diego Ruff	3	Vice Chair	x
Blanca Gadney-Moss	4	Member	x
Jonathan Childress	5	Member	x
Fareed Issa Klayel	6	Member	x
Xavier Miranda	7	Chair	Not present
Patrick Schaefer	8	Member	Not present
Eddie Gutierrez	N/A	El Paso Electric (EPE) Technical Advisor	Not present

1. MEETING CALLED TO ORDER WITH QUORUM AT 6:03 PM

a. Members present (as noted above)

b. Request to excuse absent members

- Request to excuse absent members (Patrick Schaefer, Crystal Arrieta, Xavier Miranda, and Eddie Gutierrez).
- Fred Dalbin moves to approve, Fareed Issa Klayel seconds
- Motion passes

c. Approval of minutes from 02/14/2017 meeting

- Blanca Gadney-Moss moves to approve, Fred Dalbin seconds
- Minutes approved

2. GOAL 8 ALIGNMENT: NURTURE AND PROMOTE A HEALTHY, SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY

4.1 Discussion and update on submission of SolSmart application

- Currently, after working closely with Planning and RREAC members, we are estimating that we have enough points to meet Gold (Lauren Baldwin, Staff).
- The only item we are waiting on to submit this application is to conduct a cross-training for the solar permitting process. We hope to complete this within the next couple of weeks and then submit. This training will hopefully be completed 2-3 times per year to continue improving the process (Fred Dalbin, Member).

4.2 Presentation on the energy sector in our region, with a focus on the potential for renewable energy (Hunt Institute for Global Competitiveness)

- Request to postpone presentation due to presenter being absent
- Fred Dalbin moves to postpone, Jonathan Childress seconds
- Motion passes; Presentation will be postponed until the next meeting

4.3 Discussion and action on the development of Renewable Energy Standards (RES) and Goals for the City of El Paso (new construction and municipal facilities)

- See presentation (<http://www.elpasotexas.gov/ors/RREAC>)
- Ernest Eisenberg, Member:** What is the total capacity / demand in Austin? When we had peak demand last summer, the solar performance



Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council (RREAC)

Mayor

Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

went down and we were at peak. How do they manage peak load with solar (with a source that's not consistent)?

4.3.2.1 I think that's something we want the working groups to address—looking at workability and affordability (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.2.2 How do they figure out what they make—how is that different from net metering? (Ernest Eisenberg, Member)

4.3.2.3 We can reach out to other cities and make a chart of other cities and their goals (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.3 Fareed Issa Klayel, Member: The municipality is in control of some incentives; is there a list of the ones that the City does have control over?

4.3.3.1 We can connect folks with support, such a PACE, but what we're talking about here is making new incentives. This group can recommend that we offer those. We can also look at what exists at the State and Federal level and how we can supplement and complement those (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.4 Fareed Issa Klayel, Member: Regarding ongoing operations and maintenance, how much energy are we using for our servers?

4.3.4.1 Nicole: Not sure about how much energy our servers are used but there has been some discussion about not keeping them so cold. We can reach out to IT to see if they've talked about move to the cloud (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.5 Jonathan Childress, Member: On the cost mitigation part--tragedy of the commons--how do we factor in pollution or other costs that we cannot necessary attribute to a single entity? Being equitable, how do we give them an environment that is not healthy?

4.3.5.1 That should be part of the standards we push forward (cost and benefit analysis). Would any of those "unhealthy" technologies be part of this? We would want to look at what the health impacts are, but it may be difficult to quantify (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.5.2 Financial cost is one thing, but total cost is another, especially when we're talking about equity (Jonathan Childress, Member).

4.3.5.3 I think MIT has some research on this—I think the discussion has been happening and we can factor this into our requests (Blanca Gadney-Moss, Member).

4.3.6 Ernest Eisenberg, Member: I think some of the information we already have can help tie this all together. I think the community solar and municipal solar goals are good programs that can help us reach our goals. For example, the City could estimate their usage and buy X amount of community solar based on their usage and then buy less and less of it as the community buys in, considering its cost-neutral.

4.3.6.1 I think that's a great idea as long as we don't rule out rooftop solar at the same time since it's the cheapest, easiest and cleanest... unless they can prove otherwise with data (Shelby Ruff, Vice Chair).

4.3.6.2 How do we want to move forward with this? The solar resilience



Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council (RREAC)

Mayor

Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

teams could lead the groups and we could identify who the stakeholders could be in the working groups? We would recommend that we approach Council with a comprehensive Urban Energy Plan in the Fall (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.6.2.1 There are three different subgroups (education, workforce development, policy research). I'm interested in the cost-mitigation efforts (Fareed Issa Klayel, Member)

4.3.6.2.2 Leads of the subgroups will identify key stakeholders and then please report out at the next RREAC meeting in April. We can facilitate conversations with El Paso Electric to identify who can best assist each subgroup (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.6.2.3 I can work with any group. I wanted to add that there's a disincentive for developers to have distributed renewables on their new assets because the developers have to pay to bring the electric there and then you get some portion back (Ernest Eisenberg, Member).

4.3.6.2.3.1 That might fit into the incentive and policy piece (Nicole Ferrini, Staff).

4.3.6.2.4 I'm interested in renewables (Shelby Ruff, Vice Chair)

4.3.6.2.5 I'm also interested in renewables (Blanca Gadney-Moss, Member)

4.3.6.2.6 I'm interested in demand reduction standards. I think AIA and Eco El Paso would be good stakeholders to reach out to for the renewables group (Fred Dalbin, Member).

4.3.6.2.7 I'm interested in industry and workforce development and would like to extend that to maintenance as well (Jonathan Childress, Member).

4.3.7 Public comment:

4.3.7.1 Ray Rapisand, Public: Regarding energy efficiency and peak demand. We need to diversify to have a greater impact. This would involve greater interaction between City and EPE. We don't have the industrial base in our market and we have four months of high usage. There is a company called Ice Bear Energy and they have a 5 ton unit (many installed in California) and this can really knock down the energy usage because they run on ice. People are still comfortable and it can lead to economic development. The Ice Cup is a residential model (2-3 ton) that could help our market since a lot of folks are switching to refrigerated air in El Paso. City code could encourage buildings and this could be a sustainable path forward. Also, we really ought to look at ground-source heat pumps because they are more cost effective and they reduce peak



Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council (RREAC)

Mayor

Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

demand.

4.3.7.2 Robert Moss, Public: Ernest asked a question earlier about Austin Energy and amount of capacity they have. They're proposing 600 MW of solar, their capacity as of this summer is 2,480 MW. So 600 MW is about 20%. Their capacity factor is at 40%. The point that I'm making is, with refrigeration, it drives your capacity factors down, so we need to have better control over systems that are driving our capacity factors down. Let's start looking at these other systems and correct insulation if we're switching over to refrigeration.

4.3.7.3 Ray Rapisand, Public: The residential capacity factor is lower than the overall capacity factor—which is important. That's why the heat pump option is a good option.

4.3.7.4 Robert Moss, Public: As we're addressing our demand issues, we really need to look at refrigeration.

4.3 Presentation on the effect of electric rates on renewable energy strategy and industry development (Blanca Gadney-Moss, Member)

4.3.3 See presentation (<http://www.elpasotexas.gov/ors/RREAC>)

4.3.4 Shelby Ruff, Vice Chair: These looks like potential motions that this group can make (slide 33 of presentation). I like them and think you did a good job. I think we need to influence City Council and bypass them to get to the PUC.

4.3.5 Fareed Issa Klayel, Member: I'd like to motion to make this a discussion and action for the next agenda

4.3.5.1 Shelby: seconded

4.3.5.2 Motion passes

4.3.5.3 Stakeholders need to be aware of these too. We need to bring them into the dialogue (Fareed Issa Klayel, Member).

4.3.6 In the April RREAC discussion, we can talk about the best way to bring this forward to City Council, what type of public outreach you would consider, and where this might fit into the Urban Energy Plan (Juan Gonzalez, City of El Paso Legal Department).

4.3.7 I think it might be a little premature to pass those motions fully. I think we want to fully understand those recommendations and outcomes first. I'd like to see before and after apples-to-apples comparison. How does a rate case affect costs? Solar and non-solar? (Ernest Eisenberg, Member)

4.3.8 I think there are more analyses we should look at. I think we should dig into these (Fred Dalbin, Member)

4.3.9 We can do that for before our next meeting (current versus an average) (Shelby Ruff, Member).

4.3.10 Public comment:

4.3.10.1 Ryan Green, Public: I'm a Member of ASHRAE and USGBC and I specialize in the optimization and



Regional Renewable Energy Advisory Council (RREAC)

Mayor

Oscar Leiser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

design of geothermal heat pumps. I'd like to talk about reducing consumption on site before thinking about renewables. It's also very important to understand the difference between SEER (seasonal energy efficiency ratio) and EER (energy efficiency ratio). It is highly advisable that EPE consider specifying a minimum EER at peak load outdoor air temperatures in El Paso. There was a lot of talk about where to find information about renewable energy and energy efficiency—here is a good resource: www.Dsireusa.org.

4.4 Discussion on future agenda items

4.4.3 Nicole Ferrini, Staff: We would like to have presentations from team leaders, to include, who else needs to be involved and what resources need to execute this work. We will have a discussion and action on the recommendations identified in Blanca's presentation, how those fit into the Urban Energy Plan, and if there are others that should be involved. We will also have the postponed Hunt Institute for Global Competitiveness presentation.

4.4.4 Ernest Eisenberg, Member: I would like to request City staff to provide guidance about the solar customer subsidy conversation.

4.4.4.1 The value of solar was done in Austin. We'd have to bring in an outside firm to do the analysis because it can be expensive. I'll circle back with Austin and see if I can find this information (Shelby Ruff, Vice Chair).

4.4.4.2 I just wonder how can we make an equity argument for rate classes without this? (Ernest Eisenberg, Member)

4.4.4.3 Can we make this a recommendation for CC or for the Urban Energy Plan? (Nicole Ferrini, Staff)

4.4.4.4 I'd also like to know how much extra dollars are they going to get if they get what they want versus leaving solar customers in their current rate class (Ernest Eisenberg, Member)

4.4.4.5 We need to look at the full impact of the rate case to our community (Blanca Gadney-Moss, Member)

3. ADJOURNED AT 8:06 PM

- a. Ernest Eisenberg motions to adjourn at 8:06 PM
- b. Fred Dalbin seconds
- c. Motion carries
- i. The next meeting will be **Tuesday, April 11, 2017 from 6 pm – 8 pm in the Main Conference Room of CITY 1, 300 N. Campbell.**

Please note: The statements made on the agenda items above are the opinions of those individuals noted and do not necessarily represent an official position of the City of El Paso.